

Learning Informatics AI • Analytics • Accountability • Agency

Simon Buckingham Shum

Professor of Learning Informatics Director, Connected Intelligence Centre

cic.uts.edu.au • Simon.BuckinghamShum.net • @sbuckshum



informatics

learning informatics

LA/AIED

4 informatics principles for human-centred LA/AIED what this looks like in action

We need an overarching lens for designing effective, usable, ethical learning technology

informatics

You've made a wise choice! 🙂



Kristen Nygaard August 27, 1926 – August 10, 2002

Internationally acknowledged as the co-inventor with Ole-Johan Dahl of object-oriented programming and the programming language Simula.

He also was a pioneer of participatory design and the "Scandinavian school of systems development".

http://kristennygaard.no

"Informatics is the science that has as its domain information processes and related phenomena in artifacts, society and nature".

Nygaard, K. (1986): Program Development as a Social Activity, Invited Lecture, Proceedings of the IFIP 10th World Computer Congress, INFORMATION PROCESSING 86, Dublin. Elsevier Science Publishers, pp. 189-198. Available at: <u>https://ojs.ruc.dk/index.php/pdc/article/view/97/89</u>

No management hand-waving about valuing "user participation"

Let's get specific: who are we talking about?

- Kinds of work tasks carried out.
- Position within the decision system.
- Position within the power system.

Nygaard, K. (1986): Program Development as a Social Activity, Invited Lecture, Proceedings of the IFIP 10th World Computer Congress, INFORMATION PROCESSING 86, Dublin. Elsevier Science Publishers, pp. 189-198. Available at: https://ojs.ruc.dk/index.php/pdc/article/view/97/89

How will such users get to "participate"?

"Collection, storage, processing and use of personal data shall not occur without due cause based on consideration for the operation of the enterprise. The individual enterprise shall clarify the type of personal data which the computer equipment shall collect, store, process and use."

"The enterprise shall keep their employees informed through their shop stewards about conditions which are within the scope of the agreement so that the shop stewards may express their views as early as possible and before the decisions of the enterprise are implemented, ..."

"The information shall be provided in a clear form and in language that can be understood by people without special knowledge of the field." A group's interests in systems in an enterprise or a public institution may relate to a number of issues:

- What economic benefit will we (the group) get from the system? (As employees, middle or top management, as employers.)
- To what extent may we exercise control (power) over the system?
- How will the system influence the physical and psychological working environment?
- Will the social network in the enterprise be changed to our advantage or disadvantage?
- What is the relationship between the objectives of the system and the objectives we feel should direct our society?

Data shop stewards are elected to represent group interests, and all points listed above may be raised in negotiation within the framework of the data/technology agreements presented later in this paper.

Nygaard, K. (1986): Program Development as a Social Activity, Invited Lecture, Proceedings of the IFIP 10th World Computer Congress, INFORMATION PROCESSING 86, Dublin. Elsevier Science Publishers, pp. 189-198. Available at: https://ojs.ruc.dk/index.php/pdc/article/view/97/89

This laid the foundations for Informatics today...



https://www.informatics-europe.org

"Informatics is a distinct scientific discipline, characterised by its own concepts, methods, body of knowledge and open issues. It covers the foundations of computational structures, processes, artefacts and systems; and their software designs, their applications, and their impact on society"

This laid the foundations for Informatics today...

UCI Department of Informatics Donald Bren School of Information & Computer Sciences

"Informatics concerns itself with the study of living, working and building in a digital world. Wherever technology touches people, it must be designed with ultimate care. This requires mastery of technological knowhow and a deep appreciation of the social, cultural and organizational forces at work."

learning informatics

Note that the terms **Education(al) Informatics** have been proposed, and some definitions of this are similar, albeit limited to educational institutions — I prefer a broader focus on lifelong/lifewide learning.

Levy, P., Ford, N., Foster, J., Madden, A., Miller, D., Nunes, M. B., et al. (2003). Educational informatics: An emerging research agenda. *Journal of Information Science*, 29(4), 298-210. [reprint] Collins, J.W., and Weiner, S.A. (2010). Proposal for the creation of a subdiscipline: Education informatics. *Teachers College Record* 112, no. 10: 2523–2536. [reprint]

learning informatics

How does this lens translate into deploying Analytics/AI for learning?



Design <u>socio</u>-technical systems

- Design for educator and learner agency
- Design for imperfect computational models

LA/AIED System Integrity > algorithmic accountability

Learning Analytics?

Al in Education?

What is Learning Analytics?

Learning

student engagement teaching practice curriculum design instructional design pedagogy assessment epistemology

Analytics

data statistics classification machine learning text processing visualisation predictive models

this is not a straightforward dialogue!

A key circle is missing...

Human Factors

stakeholder involvement participatory design cycles user interface design privacy and ethics end-user evaluation organisational strategy staff training

Learning Analytics: A Human-Centred Design Discipline



So where does Artificial Intelligence fit in?



So where does Artificial Intelligence fit in?



now the computer has greater agency e.g. "adaptive learning": tune the task to each learner's current ability

give personalised feedback based on the learner's progress

chatbots/avatars

AI

now the computer can sense more of the human world e.g. speech, gestures, posture, physiology, facial expression...

mobile and sensor data:
use of physical tools,
location, other apps...

Human-Centred Analytics/AI in Education

Human-Centred Analytics/AI in Education

By sbs on May 4th, 2019 | Edit

A heads-up that three collections will hit the streets this year focused on how we can design so that human needs and values are well and truly centre-stage in educational tools powered by data, analytics and AI. It will be good to have detailed 'insider accounts' from researcher/developers who are reflecting deeply on how values are baked into their design practices and the infrastructures they are building, and how different stakeholders can engage meaningfully in shaping design. I'm excited about the papers shaping up for these volumes, so watch out for their releases midand end-2019...

JOURNAL OF LEARNING ANALYTICS



http://simon.buckinghamshum.net/2019/05/human-centred-analyticsai-in-education

Learning Informatics Principle 1

Design <u>socio</u>-technical systems

Framework @UTS for educators to co-design Analytics/AI → augment teaching practice



PhD by Antonette Shibani: http://simon.buckinghamshum.net/2019/11/congratulations-dr-antonette-shibani

Shibani, A., Knight, S. and Buckingham Shum, S. (2019). Contextualizable Learning Analytics Design: A Generic Model, and Writing Analytics Evaluations. *Proc. 9th International Conference on Learning Analytics & Knowledge (LAK19)*. ACM Press, NY, pp. 210-219. DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.1145/3303772.3303785</u>. Eprint: <u>https://tinyurl.com/lak19clad</u>

Bundling analytics with educator resources Integrating Writing Activities with Writing Analytics

Higher Education Text Analytics consortium: <u>http://heta.io/resources</u>

UTS Orientation Portal: <u>https://uts.edu.au/acawriter</u>



Strong learning design and feedback design practices can compensate for weak machine intelligence



http://bit.ly/daffi2020

The role of automated feedback systems in creating feedback-rich environments

Purpose of this symposium

The original concept was to bring the editors and authors from The Impact of Feedback in Higher Education: Improving Assessment Outcomes for Learners (Eds. Henderson, Ajjawi, Boud & Molloy) to the UTS Connected Intelligence Centre, to spend 2 days in a workshop. The pandemic shifted this online, but the goals remain the same and moving online enabled us to more easily bring in additional participants.

"This book asks how we might conceptualise, design for and evaluate the impact of feedback in higher education. Ultimately, the purpose of feedback is to improve what students can do: therefore, effective feedback must have impact. Students need to be actively engaged in seeking, sense-making and acting upon any information



provided to them in order to develop and improve. Feedback can thus be understood as not just the giving of information, but as a complex process integral to teaching and learning in which both teachers and students have an important role to play. The editors challenge us to ask two fundamental questions: when does feedback make a difference, and how can we recognise that impact?"

We call for a deeper dialogue between researchers in the design of assessment and feedback in higher education, and researchers developing automated-feedback tools using Learning Analytics/AI.

Raising data/learning analytics literacy

(staff and students)

UTS Open: https://open.uts.edu.au



TASTER COURSE

What Does Facebook Know About You?

Unveil the data that Facebook holds on us and discover how it's shaping the way we consume the news.



TASTER COURSE

Journey Through Data

Engage with data systematically and strategically and learn how to tell a data story.

(\$) Free ∑ Self paced ⊘ Online



Enrol Now

CARDING THE PARTY OF THE PARTY

TASTER COURSE

Making Decisions in Uncertainty

How do we decide what to do when it's hard to assess all the factors, or be sure of the outcomes?

S Free ∑ Self paced O Online



TASTER COURSE Writing an Abstract

Want to write an engaging and effective abstract? Learn the hallmark moves in abstracts and how to apply them in your writing.

Raising data/learning analytics literacy

Disseminating innovations in Learning Analytics to the UTS community Briefings • Hands-on Training • Teaching into degree programs



CIC Events archive: <u>https://cic.uts.edu.au/events</u>

CIC's organisational positioning



HYBRID INNOVATION/SERVICES CENTRE:

Launched 2014 after 3 years cross-university consultation \rightarrow Connected Intelligence Strategy

Reporting to DVC (Education & Students)

Analytics R&D in a non-faculty centre: academics, PhDs, full-stack & UX developers, data scientists, professional admin support, interns

Academic and training programs:

- Transdisciplinary Master of Data Science & Innovation (2015-18)
- PhD program in Learning Analytics (2016-)
- Online and blended data literacy (2015-20)

Deploy IT-approved systems UTS-wide

CIC skillset

Interpersonal skills

Education, Learning Design, Interface Design, Programming, Web Development, Text Analytics, Machine Learning, Statistics, Visualisation, Decision-Support, Sensemaking, Creativity & Risk, Participatory Design

+

Board Room

VC/DVCs/Deans/Directors

Common Room

Academic staff

Server Room

Organizational architecture for hybrid analytics innovation + service centres

earning Analytics

interacing for ouscallable impac

Simon J. Buckingham Shum and Timothy A. McKay



carning analytics is an academic field that has been taking shape under that banner since around 2010, and it has featured regularly in reports on learning technology futures over the years. It sits at the convergence of learning (learning technology, educational research, learning/assessment sciences), analytics (statistics, visualization, computer/data sciences, artificial intelligence), and human-computer interaction (participatory design, behavioral science, sociotechnical systems design, usability evaluation). In light of the significant investments that some colleges and universities are making in their analytics infrastructures, how can an institution architect itself to innovate at this disciplinary intersectionto innovate pedagogically and analytically in order to tackle substantial, strategically important teaching and learning challenges? In short, how can an institution innovate for sustainable impact?

MARCH/APRIL 2018 ENUCAUSET COTOW 25

A comparison of the drivers behind the creation of 2 university analytics innovation centres, and the org structures that enable impact:

University of Technology Sydney's Connected Intelligence Centre

University of Michigan's Digital Innovation Greenhouse

EDUCAUSE Review

https://er.educause.edu/articles/2018/3/architecting-for-learning-analytics-innovating-for-sustainable-impact

Learning Informatics Principle 2

Design for educator and learner agency

PhDs by Carlos Alvarez-Prieto and Vanessa Echeverria:

http://simon.buckinghamshum.net/2020/09/congratulations-dr-carlos-prieto-alvarez http://simon.buckinghamshum.net/2020/05/congratulations-dr-vanessa-echeverria

Multimodal student data from simulations



Personalised feedback on high performance teamwork

Who did what, when in a nursing simulation? Team Timeline for evidence-based debriefings



Echeverria, V., Martinez-Maldonado, R. and Buckingham Shum, S. (2019). Towards Collaboration Translucence: Giving Meaning to Multimodal Group Data. In *Proceedings of ACM Conference on Human Factors in Computing (CHI'19).* ACM: NY. Paper 39, pp. 1-16. <u>https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300269</u> Open Access Eprint: <u>http://bit.ly/chi19utscic</u>

Co-design techniques to engage students and staff in designing multimodal learning analytics



Prieto-Alvarez, C.G., Martinez-Maldonado, R. and Buckingham Shum, S. (2018). Mapping Learner-Data Journeys: Evolution of a Visual Co-design Tool. *Proceedings of the 30th Australian Conference on Computer-Human Interaction (OzCHI'18),* Melbourne, Australia, Dec. 2018, ACM, New York, NY, USA, pp. 205–214. DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.1145/3292147.3292168</u>



MODELLING THE SEMANTICS OF LOCATION

Extensive consultation with educators informed the modelling of 5 key "zones of interest" to help interpret positional data



Echeverria, V., Martinez-Maldonado, R. and Buckingham Shum, S. (2019). Towards Collaboration Translucence: Giving Meaning to Multimodal Group Data. In *Proceedings CHI 2019*. Paper 39, 1-16. (May 4-9, 2019, Glasgow, UK) https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300269

Making multimodal streams meaningful for nursing student team feedback

From multimodal logs to curriculum outcomes

Curriculum outcomes



CHI'19: https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300269

CHI'19: https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300269

Making multimodal streams meaningful for nursing student team feedback

From multimodal logs to curriculum outcomes

Curriculum outcomes Constructs for collaborative activity (from ACAD Framework)



CHI'19: https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300269

Making multimodal streams meaningful for nursing student team feedback

From multimodal logs to curriculum outcomes



LA-DECK: card-based co-design tool for LA



Toolkit available http://ladeck.utscic.edu.au

Prieto-Alvarez, C.G., Martinez-Maldonado, R. and Buckingham Shum, S. (2020). LA-DECK: A Card-Based Learning Analytics Co-Design Tool. *Proc. 10th International Conference on Learning Analytics and Knowledge,* Frankfurt, March 2020, ACM. 10 pages. DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.1145/3375462.3375476</u>

LA-DECK: card-based co-design tool for LA



Automated formative feedback on reflective writing

Knight, S., Shibani, A., Abel, S., Gibson, A., Ryan, P., Sutton, N., Wight, R., Lucas, C., Sándor, Á., Kitto, K., Liu, M., Mogarkar, R. & Buckingham Shum, S. (2020). AcaWriter: A learning analytics tool for formative feedback on academic writing. Journal of Writing Research, 12, (1), 141-186. https://doi.org/10.17239/jowr-2020.12.01.06



Participatory prototyping with educators to build trust in the NLP

| ademics (3 nour workshop) |
|---|
| al, calibrate the parser detecting affect in |
| lective writing, working through sample texts |
| 5 5 5 1 |
| pid prototyping with a Python notebook, then egrated into full application for further testing |
| |
| |
| |

http://heta.io/how-can-writing-analytics-researchers-rapidly-codesign-feedback-with-educators

Learning Informatics Principle 3

Design for imperfect computational models

Kirsty Kitto, Simon Buckingham Shum, and Andrew Gibson. (2018). Embracing Imperfection in Learning Analytics. In *Proceedings LAK18: International Conference on Learning Analytics and Knowledge*, March 5–9, 2018, Sydney, NSW, Australia, pp.451-460. (ACM, New York, NY, USA). <u>https://doi.org/10.1145/3170358.3170413</u>

We must equip graduates with the distinctive qualities that will keep them in jobs that won't be automated...

> ...but if we want to use LA/AIED in such teaching and learning, tracking/assessing such competencies will be imperfect

The Navajo rug

"In a Navajo rug there is always an imperfection woven into the corner. And interestingly enough, it's where "the Spirit moves in and out of the rug." The pattern is perfect and then there's one part of it that clearly looks like a mistake . . .

Perfection is not the elimination of imperfection. [...] Perfection, rather, is the ability to incorporate imperfection! [...] You either incorporate imperfection, or you fall into denial."

Richard Rohr (2011). Breathing Under Water: Spirituality and the Twelve Steps. Cincinnati, OH: Franciscan Media See also: <u>https://medium.com/bedolabs/success-through-imperfection-c3ef21cb32ed</u>



Cultivating the disposition and capacity to "learn how to learn"

Reflection and metacognition are among the highest order outcomes that we aspire to cultivate in learners — the desire and skills to observe one's thoughts, emotions and actions, and glean insights

Reflection on machine intelligence is part of this: critical engagement with AI is now a lifelong learning competency

Tracking such competencies is currently at the edge of A.I.



Authentic learning \rightarrow C21/LLL competencies

Embodied, skilled performance:

an important part of the learning experience is physically embodied (e.g. inspecting a forest; a social services risk assessment) it's impossible to tightly control what will happen, as well as making outcomes far harder to digitally monitor.

Wicked problems (Horst Rittel):

problems with no correct answer, and no stopping rules — even the definition of the <u>problem</u> is contested



Authentic learning \rightarrow C21/LLL competencies

Socially and psychologically complex performance: scenarios where the outcome is emergent in nature, a function of many drivers that result in unpredictable and/or unique outcomes (e.g. a social worker client interview; conflict resolution)

Deep reflection: the sense that a learner makes of their experience, or a shift in worldview, which by definition is not accessible to the machine, but to which a machine might have partial access



cognitive dissonance provides a teachable moment...

Imperfect Learning Analytics \rightarrow cognitive dissonance

"...as D'Mello and Graesser [15] demonstrate, it is when the student experiences dissonance because the analytics fail to match their expectations that they are likely to reflect on why they think the machine is wrong. We believe that this form of critical questioning is more likely to happen if the student has been given an underlying reason to be a little distrustful of the classifier."

Kirsty Kitto, Simon Buckingham Shum, and Andrew Gibson. (2018). Embracing Imperfection in Learning Analytics. In *Proceedings LAK18: International Conference on Learning Analytics and Knowledge*, March 5–9, 2018, Sydney, NSW, Australia, pp.451-460. (ACM, New York, NY, USA). <u>https://doi.org/10.1145/3170358.3170413</u>



Learners' engagement with intelligent technology should not be <u>mindless</u>.

On the contrary we should design for...

"nonautomatic, effortful and thus metacognitively guided processes"

Gavriel Salomon, David Perkins and Tamar Globerson (1991). Partners in cognition: extending human intelligence with intelligent technologies. Educational Researcher 20, 3 (1991), 2–9.

"Embracing Imperfection in Learning Analytics"

1. Robust learning design ensures that the activity involving automated feedback is meaningful whether or not the technology always works

2. Explicit encouragement — in student briefings, and in the user interface — to **push back if they disagree** with the feedback

| Analytical Report | Feedback | Resources |
|--|--------------------------|---------------------|
| Thank you for submitting you from revision. Research sho | ur draft to AcaWriter.Qu | ality writing comes |
| being improve the quality of | | |

Remember AcaWriter is a machine – so it may not highlight all your moves correctly and could give you incorrect feedback. So, don't be afraid to disagree with the feedback, if you believe you have included all three moves in the correct order.

It seems you have explained how your research fills the gap or solves the research problem [Move 3 – Occupying the niche (S or N sentences)] before you have indicated the gap or explained your research problem [Move 2 Establishing a niche (C or Q sentences)]. It is more effective to indicate the gap and explain the research problem before you state your solution and aim of your study. Go back and revise

Cultivating "automated feedback literacy"

"Feedback literacy" (Boud) feedback ≠ transmitting information: systemic implications for learning design and assessment

As analytics/AI enable increasing amounts of <u>automated</u> feedback, learners must now develop a new literacy: knowing how much to trust the machine's judgement, and being able to push back when they disagree





Learning Informatics Principle 4

LA/AIED System Integrity > "algorithmic accountability"

Remind me, why should I trust this system?



Growing public literacy around algorithmic bias and the need for accountability is to be welcomed



...but is there anything distinctive about algorithms for teaching and learning that shapes how we frame "accountability"?

Stakeholders and key transitions in designing a Learning Analytics system



So the algorithm is just one ingredient. A better name might be

LA/AIED System Integrity



Remind me, why should I trust this system? Because... <argument>

Accountability in terms of: Computer Science



Accountability in terms of: Data Science



Accountability in terms of: User-Centred Design



Accountability in terms of: Learning Sciences & Educational Technology



More detailed version...



LASI tutorial: http://simon.buckinghamshum.net/2019/11/black-box-learning-analytics

Elsewhere I have argued that this constitutes a transition in education's knowledge infrastructure and discuss different theory \rightarrow analytics mappings



ICLS 2018 keynote: <u>http://simon.buckinghamshum.net/2018/06/icls2018-keynote</u>

Towards "data agreements" and "data shop stewards" with students and academics

Draft for consultation

UTS Learning Analytics Principles

Introduction: why we need this

Learning Analytics

Firstly, what do we mean by "Learning Analytics" at UTS?

Learning Analytics refers to the use of data science and analytics tools to analyse and improve education. However, the creation of productive, usable tools requires integrated expertise from other fields including education, usability, instructional design and ethics, with input from the people expected to use the tools, such as students and educators.

Learning Analytics may take into account **background data** about students and educators (e.g. nationality, educational history, gender, age), and **engagement data** (with the resources and tools on different websites at UTS).

Learning Analytics can be experienced **inside an existing UTS website** (e.g. Canvas) or as a **specialised website** (e.g. AcaWriter).

Learning Analytics can be used to support both face-to-face and online teaching and learning.

Data provides incomplete impressions of people, so important decisions aren't automated

People are complex, and live complex lives. Data gathered using Learning Analytics never provides the whole picture about someone's capability. In fact, we want students and teachers to demonstrate *creativity* — which may well not fit what an algorithm 'expects' to see based on what most people do. So data never "speaks for itself" (a common assumption) but requires interpretation in context. Humans will therefore always be involved in making significant decisions about individuals.

Data is historical, so we are alert to bias

Since data is always a picture of the past, data about people can reflect historic injustices (such as systemic inequalities in the kinds of people who have studied or taught at UTS). Knowing this, we ensure that Learning Analytics do not accidentally perpetuate those injustices: there should be no assumption that past demographics/behaviours determine how we interpret current data.

We equip our target audiences to make effective use of Learning Analytics

While many digital tools are meant to be usable without any training (e.g. retail websites and mobile phone apps), more complex tools do require training. The introduction of Learning Analytics tools will be supported by relevant development activities/resources, so that users are equipped to interpret the information displayed in order to take appropriate actions.

to conclude...

learning informatics

How does this lens translate into deploying Analytics/AI for learning?



Design <u>socio</u>-technical systems

- Design for educator and learner agency
- Design for imperfect computational models

LA/AIED System Integrity > algorithmic accountability

Balancing and aligning the elements

Stakeholder Agency

Learning Design

User Experience

Organisational Strategy